



Discrete Optimization (MA 3502), WiSe 2012/13

Prof. Dr. P. Gritzmann, Dr. René Brandenburg  
Problem Sheet 4

---

**Problem 4.1**

Show that any matrix  $A \in \{-1, 0, 1\}^{m \times n}$  is totally unimodular, iff the polytope

$$P = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n : a \leq Ax \leq b, c \leq x \leq d\}$$

is integral for all  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}^m$  and  $c, d \in \mathbb{Z}^n$ .

*Solution to problem 4.1*

The system  $a \leq Ax \leq b, c \leq x \leq d$  may be represented as

$$\begin{array}{rcl} Ax & \leq & b \\ -Ax & \leq & -a \\ -I_n x & \leq & -c \\ I_n x & \leq & d \end{array}$$

Thus the statement follows from Corollary 3.2.13 and Remark 3.3.1.

**Problem 4.2**

a) For the following matrices, determine whether they are unimodular or even totally unimodular. If the matrices are not unimodular (respectively totally unimodular), identify appropriate submatrices whose determinant is not in  $\{-1, 0, 1\}$ .

$$A_1 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 \\ -1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix} \quad A_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ -1 & -1 \\ -1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \quad A_3 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -1 & -1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \\ -1 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

b) Describe the idea of a (polynomial) algorithm which tests whether a given matrix  $A$  fulfills the conditions in Corollary 3.3.3.

*Solution to problem 4.2*

- a) (i)  $A_1$  is unimodular (it has determinant 1), but not totally unimodular since  $\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}$  is a square submatrix with determinant  $-2$ .
- (ii)  $A_2$  is not unimodular since  $\begin{pmatrix} -1 & -1 \\ -1 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$  is a square submatrix of maximal size with determinant  $-2$ . For the same reason,  $A_2$  is also not totally unimodular.
- (iii)  $A_3$  is unimodular and totally unimodular.

- b) Surely, it is quite easy to check, if all columns have at most two non-zero entries. Thus assuming this to be true, we construct a graph  $G$  which is bipartite iff the partition as described in Corollary 2.24 is possible. We assign one vertex to each row of  $A$ . If a column of  $A$  contains two 1 entries or two  $-1$  entries we connect the vertices of the corresponding rows with an edge. If a column contains one 1 and one  $-1$  entry we add an additional vertex to the graph and connect this new vertex with the vertices corresponding to the  $-1$  and 1 entries. Obviously, every partition of the rows of  $A$  (as in 2.24) leads to a partition of the vertices in the constructed graph which shows that it is bipartite and vice versa. As we know it is possible to check if a graph is bipartite in polynomial time.

### Problem 4.3

- a) Which of the following statements are true and which are false? Give a proof or a counter-example.
- (i) If  $A$  is a square, totally unimodular matrix, then all eigenvalues of  $A$  are in  $\{-1, 0, 1\}$
  - (ii) If  $A \in \mathbb{Z}^{d \times n}$  is totally unimodular and  $B \in \{-1, 0, 1\}^{m \times n}$ , then  $\begin{pmatrix} A \\ B \end{pmatrix}$  is unimodular.
  - (iii) If  $A \in \mathbb{Z}^{n \times n}$  is totally unimodular and has rank  $n$ , then  $\text{HNF}(A) = I$  (where  $I$  denotes the identity matrix).
  - (iv) If  $A, B$  are totally unimodular, then  $\begin{pmatrix} A & 0 \\ 0 & B \end{pmatrix}$  is also totally unimodular.
- b) Show that every totally unimodular matrix  $A$  has the following properties:
- (i) Every regular submatrix of  $A$  has at least one row with an odd number of non-zero entries.
  - (ii) The sum over all entries in every square submatrix of  $A$  with even row and column sums is divisible by 4.

*Remark:* Both properties characterise total unimodularity!

*Solution to problem 4.3*

- a) (i) False, e.g.  $A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$  is totally unimodular and 2 is an eigenvalue.
- (ii) False, e.g.  $A = (1, 1)$  is totally unimodular and  $B = (1, -1) \in \{-1, 0, 1\}^{1 \times 2}$ , but  $\begin{pmatrix} A \\ B \end{pmatrix}$  has determinant 2, so is not unimodular.
- (iii) True: The determinant of  $\text{HNF}(A)$  is the same as that of  $A$  up to sign. Since  $A$  has rank  $n$  and is totally unimodular, it has determinant  $\pm 1$ . Thus  $\text{HNF}(A)$  has determinant 1 (all entries on the diagonal must be positive, and the determinant is their product). Furthermore, since  $\text{HNF}(A)$  is integral, the values on the diagonal are all 1, and therefore the values elsewhere must be 0. Thus  $\text{HNF}(A) = I$ .

- (iv) True:  $P = \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} x \\ y \end{pmatrix} : \begin{pmatrix} A & 0 \\ 0 & B \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} x \\ y \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} b \\ c \end{pmatrix}, x, y \geq 0 \right\}$  is for any right-hand side  $\begin{pmatrix} b \\ c \end{pmatrix}$  the cartesian product  $P_1 \times P_2$  of the integral polytopes  $P_1 = \{x : Ax = b, x \geq 0\}$  and  $P_2 = \{y : By = c, y \geq 0\}$  and therefore again integral. Hence  $\begin{pmatrix} A & 0 \\ 0 & B \end{pmatrix}$  must be totally unimodular.

Alternatively: Any square submatrix  $C$  has the form  $C = \begin{pmatrix} A' & 0 \\ 0 & B' \end{pmatrix}$ , where  $A'$  and  $B'$  are submatrices of  $A$  and  $B$  respectively. If these are not square, then  $C$  has determinant 0. If they are square, then  $\det(C) = \det(A')\det(B') \in \{-1, 0, 1\}$ .

- b) By Theorem 2.23 it follows from total unimodularity of  $A$  that for each  $k \times k$ -submatrix  $B$  of  $A$  there exists a partition  $(I, J)$  of the columns  $b_i$  of  $B$  such that  $\sum_{i \in I} b_i - \sum_{i \in J} b_i \in \{0, \pm 1\}^k$ , in other words there exists an  $x \in \{-1, +1\}^k$  such that  $Bx = \{0, \pm 1\}^k$ .
- (i) We assume that every row of  $B$  contains an even number of non-zero entries. This implies  $Bx$  even and with  $Bx \in \{-1, 0, 1\}^k$  we obtain  $Bx = 0$  and so  $B$  singular.
- (ii) Using (i) it follows that the partition of the columns of  $B$  into submatrices  $B_1$  and  $B_2$  such that the sum of the columns of  $B_1$  yields the same vector as the sum of the columns of  $B_2$ . Let  $S$  be the sum of all entries of  $B$  and let  $S_i$  be the sum of all entries of  $B_i$ ,  $i = 1, 2$ . So we have  $S_1 = S_2$  and  $S_1$  even (as all column sums are even). Thus it follows that  $S = S_1 + S_2 = 2S_1$  is divisible by 4.

Please note that with the assumption from above one can prove the equivalence of all the statements.

#### Problem 4.4

Let  $G = (V, E)$  be a connected graph,  $|V| = n$ ,  $|E| = m$  and  $S_G$  the incidence matrix of  $G$ . Show that:

- a) The set  $\{x \in \{0, 1\}^m : S_G x = \mathbf{1}\}$  describes exactly the set of perfect matchings in  $G$ .
- b) All vertices  $x^*$  of the polytope  $P = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^m : S_G x = \mathbf{1}, x \geq 0\}$  fulfill  $2x^* \in \mathbb{Z}^m$  and (moreover)  $x^* \in \mathbb{Z}^m$  if  $G$  is bipartite (i.e.  $P = P_I$  and the vertices of  $P$  are exactly the incidence vectors of the perfect matchings in  $G$ ).

*Solution to problem 4.4*

- a) With  $x_j = 1$  if edge  $j$  is in the matching and  $x_j = 0$  if not  $S_G x = \mathbf{1}$  encodes that each vertex belongs to exactly 1 edge.
- b) first option:  
First note: If  $G$  is bipartite, then  $S_G$  is totally unimodular (Theorem 3.4.1) and therefore  $x^* \in \mathbb{Z}^m$  for all vertices  $x^*$  of  $P$ .

Now we prove: For general graphs  $G$ , all vertices  $x^*$  of the polytope  $P = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^m : S_G x = \mathbf{1}, x \geq 0\}$  satisfy  $2x^* \in \mathbb{Z}^m$ .

Consider the graph  $G'' = (V'', E'')$  with two vertices  $v_{i1}, v_{i2} \in V''$  for each vertex  $v_i \in V$  and edges  $v_{i1}v_{j2}, v_{i2}v_{j1} \in E''$  for each edge  $v_i v_j \in E$ .

Obviously  $G''$  is bipartite and so all vertices  $y^*$  of the corresponding relaxed matching-polytope

$Q = \{y \in \mathbb{R}^{2m} : S_{G''}y = \mathbf{1}, y \geq 0\}$  are integral. Now one can easily check from correspondence of bases between  $P$  and  $Q$  that the vertices of  $P$  are exactly the vectors  $x$  with

$$x_i := \begin{cases} 0 & , \text{ if } y_i = y_{i+m} = 0 \\ 1 & , \text{ if } y_i = y_{i+m} = 1 \text{ and } y \text{ vertex of the polytope belonging to } G'' \text{ and so every vertex} \\ \frac{1}{2} & , \text{ else} \end{cases}$$

$x \in P$  is  $\in \{0, \frac{1}{2}, 1\}^m$ .

second option:

Let  $x^*$  be a vertex of  $P$  and let  $B_{x^*}$  be a basis matrix of  $x^*$  which is invertible (notice that the basis matrix is not unique because  $x^*$  is degenerate in general).

W.l.o.g. the basis matrix has the structure  $B_{x^*} = \begin{pmatrix} A_1 & 0 & & 0 \\ 0 & A_2 & & \\ & & \ddots & 0 \\ 0 & & 0 & A_k \end{pmatrix}$  with  $A_1, \dots, A_k$  corre-

sponding to the connected components. By Cramer's rule we obtain  $x_i^* = \frac{\det B_{x^*}^i}{\det B_{x^*}}$ .

To simplify we consider  $i = 1$  (the other cases follow analogously).

Thus  $B_{x^*}^1 = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{1} & A_1' & 0 & & 0 \\ \mathbf{1} & 0 & A_2 & & \\ \vdots & & & \ddots & 0 \\ \mathbf{1} & & 0 & & A_k \end{pmatrix}$  and therefore  $x_1^* = \frac{\det(B_{x^*}^1)}{\det(B_{x^*})} = \frac{\det(\mathbf{1}A_1') \cdot \prod_{i=2}^k \det(A_i)}{\prod_{i=1}^k \det A_i} =$

$\frac{\det(\mathbf{1}A_1')}{\det A_1}$  with  $\det A_1 \in \{-2, -1, 1, 2\}$ . And for  $G$  bipartit it is  $\det A_1 \in \{-1, 1\}$ .